**Analysis of Mentoring**

**June 28, 2010**

**1) Scholarship Reconsidered, Ernest Boyer, 1990**

- In discussing the colonial college Boyer states, “This tradition, one that affirmed the centrality of teaching, persisted well into the nineteenth century. Young scholars continued to be the central focus of collegiate life, and faculty were employed with the understanding that they would be educational mentors, both in the classroom and beyond.” (pg 4)

-Boyer states, “In the end, inspired teaching keeps the flame of scholarship alive. Almost all successful academics give credit to creative teachers—those mentors who defined their work so compellingly that it became, for them, a lifetime challenge. Without the teaching function, the continuity of knowledge will be broken and the store of human knowledge dangerously diminished.” (pg 24)

-Boyer discusses in this book his view on what it means to be a scholar and describes them in four categories:

 Scholarship of Discovery

 Scholarship of Integration

 Scholarship of Application

 Scholarship of Teaching

Boyer states that such a vision of scholarship which recognizes diversity and talent within the professoriate may also prove helpful as they reflect on the direction and meaning of their professional lives. (pg 24, 25)

-Boyer discusses the new generation of scholars and how the pendulum maybe swinging back from the point where, “Many of today’s older faculty, following the footsteps of their mentors, took a promising first job offer and after tenure, moved up the academic ladder, gaining recognition and prestige.” (pg 65) This system used to work for many years states Boyer, however, now new faculty are facing restrictions, lack of mobility, and frustration within the academy.

-Boyer states that there is still such a small pool of qualified minority applicants and in this country we have failed to cultivate diverse faculty. (pg 66)

-Graduate education according to Boyer should be more attentive to the scholarship of application. “Future scholars should be asked to think about the usefulness of knowledge, to reflect on the social consequences of their work, and in so doing gain understanding of how their own study relates to the world beyond the campus.” (pg 69)

-Boyer discussed how “Graduate students, in preparing to teach, also might be asked to work with mentors—veteran faculty who have distinguished themselves by the quality of their instruction.” (pg 72)

**2) Scholarship in Public: Knowledge Creation and Tenure Policy in the Engaged University – Eatman/Ellison, 2008**

-Publicly Active Graduate Students

“The University of Michigan’s excellent resource, *How to Mentor Graduate Students: A Guide for Faculty at a Diverse University*, was developed through an exemplary process of collaboration with graduate students and faculty members. It provides good advice and thoroughly convincing best practices. However, it presents graduate students almost exclusively as the recipients of wisdom, without attributing to them the capacity to exercise agency in electing research or creative projects informed by civic commitments and acquiring the skills needed to advance those projects. The language of mentoring often assumes lack, dependency, or neediness. Can we move toward a strength-based, or asset-based, model of mentoring?” (pg 20)

**3) Scholarship Assessed, Glassick/Huber/Maeroff, 1997**

-According to the authors, “Good mentoring is surely the best preparation for faculty evaluation, although it is the hardest to write into the rules. A good mentor can coach a scholar through the major decisions that he or she must make in the probationary years, indeed, throughout a career. Young scholars in particular make many choices about when to pursue the various strands of their research, which courses to design or teach, what applied work or public scholarship to undertake. A good mentor has an eye for the contributions that rate highest with the department or program and can also advise a young scholar about the administrative and committee work that is expected of him or her. Mentoring may prove especially important for minority and female faculty, who frequently face extra pressures in the course of their careers.” (pg 55)

4) **Student Success in College – Creating Conditions that matter, Kuh/Kinzie/Schuh/Whitt and Associates, 2005**

-At the University of Kansas “New faculty orientation pairs a senior faculty mentor with a new faculty member to foster understanding of the campus culture, including an emphasis on undergraduate student learning.” (pg 119)

-Michigan University has a mentorship program which “Matches up groups of four first-year students with an advanced student and a faculty or staff member who share similar academic interests.” (pg 212)

**5) AERA Highlights – From the Desk of the President – Mentoring in a Changed Environment, 2009**

-AERA devotes a lot of its efforts to mentoring graduate students and early career scholars. McDonnell, AERA’s president states, “Traditional mentoring strategies assumed that most graduate students and early career scholars would either enter university teaching and research on the tenure track or take a research position in an education agency or a public policy institution that would allow them to pursue a career there or to move eventually into a faculty position. However, trends in postsecondary education suggest that a very different set of assumptions is now required.”

**6)Enhancing Graduate Education: Promoting a Scholarship of Teaching and Learning Through Mentoring, Trask/Marotz-Baden/Settles/Gentry/Berke, 2009**

-The authors state that, “One potential arena that has barely been explored is academic writings in how formal and informal mentoring could enhance the education and professional development of graduate students.” (pg 439)

-The authors give their definition of mentoring. “In popular usage, mentoring is defined as a ‘deliberate pairing of a more skilled or experienced person with a lesser skilled or experienced one, with the agreed-upon goals of having the lesser skilled person grow and develop specific competencies’ (Murray, 1991, p. 4). This definition also encompasses the notion that a mentor is to be concerned with the upward mobility of their proteges’ careers. (Kram, 1985) However, in academic environments, “Mentoring is often described as a relationship between individuals that involves passing on traditional academic norms and values” (Goodwin, Stevens, & Bellamy, 1998). “As a concept, mentorship, suggests that there is an asymmetric relationship among the faculty and their graduate students.’ (pg 440)

-“While there is no consensus about what elements make mentoring successful, there is a great deal of acknowledgement that it does work and that we need to promote it (Girves, Zepeda, & Gallmey, 2005).

-Gibson (2004) identified five themes in her research on academic mentoring, that she suggests are more important than agreeing on a definition. (see page 440)

-“Minority faculty often cite poor mentoring relationships and the problems associated with being the only faculty or graduate student of color in predominantly white institutions, as reasons for low numbers. Tenure also remains difficult to attain due to a lack of scholarly recognition for work that focuses on ethnic minority populations (Antonio, 2002). (pg 441)

-“On an institutional level, it is important for both private and public institutions to acknowledge the value of mentoring and to incorporate this dimension of professional responsibilities into every aspect of support and evaluation of faculty.” “To date, we have a very limited dialogue about the critical importance of linking mentoring with a scholarship of teaching and learning. (pg 444)